

## **BOARD OF HIGHER EDUCATION**

---

October 23, 2018  
10:00 a.m.

Bunker Hill Community College  
Health and Wellness Center Gymnasium  
250 New Rutherford Ave  
Boston, MA

### **Meeting Minutes**

A meeting of the Board of Higher Education (BHE) was held on Tuesday, October 23, 2018 in Health and Wellness Center Gymnasium at Bunker Hill Community College (BHCC) at 250 New Rutherford Ave, Boston, Massachusetts.

#### **The following Board Members were present:**

Chris Gabrieli, Chair  
Alex Cortez  
Tom Hopcroft  
J.D. La Rock  
Paul Mattera  
Michael O'Brien  
Kush Patel, voting student member  
James Peyser, Secretary of Education, Ex-Officio  
Fernando Reimers  
Paul Toner

Nick Papa, non-voting student advisor for the State University Segment  
Stephanie Teixeira, non-voting student advisor for the Community College Segment

Carlos E. Santiago, Commissioner and Secretary to the Board

#### **The following Board members were absent:**

Sheila Harrity, Vice Chair  
Nancy Hoffman

#### **I. CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Chris Gabrieli called the meeting of the BHE to order at 10:07 a.m.

#### **II. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

*Document Submitted: MSCA Handout*

Chair Gabrieli announced that he received a request from C.J. O'Donnell, of the Massachusetts State College Association (MSCA), to address the Board and he asked Mr. O'Donnell to come

forward. Amy Everitt stated that C.J. O'Donnell was unable to attend and gave the remarks on his behalf.

Miss Everitt thanked Secretary Peyser and the BHE for hearing the MSCA today, who represent faculty and librarians at the nine state universities. She stated that she is filling in for C.J. O'Donnell. She stated that today is the 480<sup>th</sup> day that the MSCA has gone without a contract. She also stated that in July, Commissioner Santiago signed a contract, that was negotiated in good faith by all parties. However, the Commissioner has yet to submit the agreed upon contract to the Governor for funding as required by law. She continued that the MSCA has received only silence on all requests to meet on the matter. She concluded by stating that the MSCA has just one question: has the contract been submitted? They are here today to encourage the Commissioner and encourage the Board to follow through on their promises and take the necessary next steps as required under law. Chair Gabrieli thanked Ms. Everitt for her remarks.

### **III. WELCOME**

Chair Gabrieli welcomed BHCC President Pam Eddinger. She welcomed everyone, acknowledged the students in attendance, and remarked that "we are here for you." She observed that today's BHE meeting is in the newest building on campus, which is now 10 years old. It is the largest meeting space on campus. BHCC is the largest community college in the system, and along with MassBay Community College and Roxbury Community College, they are Boston's community colleges. She continued that most students come to campus via public transportation, and most of our students stay in the area. She stated, "we are the tax base" as 75% of our students work, adding that BHCC has many part time students because our students have to work. In addition, 60% of our students are parents who are taking care of their own children or other family members. President Eddinger also stated that 77% of their students are in the two lowest quintiles of income, which is in great contrast to the rest of the area. She remarked, "there is magic here though," noting that BHCC students are economically upwardly mobile. There are seven locations, including one at Malden High School. BHCC serves gateway cities, and she hopes the sites will continue to grow. She again, welcomed everyone to BHCC and thanked the BHE for the opportunity to say good things about their students.

### **IV. ACCEPTANCE OF MINUTES**

Chair Gabrieli brought forth a motion to accept the Minutes of the June 19, 2018 BHE meeting. The motion was seconded and the Minutes were approved unanimously by all Board members present.

### **V. REMARKS AND REPORTS**

#### **A. CHAIRMAN'S REMARKS**

##### Documents Used

*October 19, 2018 Memorandum from Chair Gabrieli and Commissioner Santiago to the BHE regarding BHE Retreat Follow-up*

Chair Gabrieli noted his remarks today would cover three topics.

First, the Early College Initiative, which will be discussed more in depth later on today's agenda. He remarked that he has had an opportunity to visit several early college sites, and it is heartening for all of the parties involved. He cited Chelsea and Charlestown, which are associated with BHCC and stated it is a critical moment for early college programs.

Second, he began to discuss of the efforts of the Transitions for Higher Education: Safeguarding the Interest of Students (THESIS) working group, of which BHE members Paul Mattera and Alex Cortez are members . He said the group is focused on addressing the risk of private higher education institutions' financial crises and abrupt closures. Financial crises affect our students' ability to succeed and THESIS will examine fundamental underlying risks and how schools monitor that risk to ensure disruptions do not happen. He continued that they had pro bono support from EY-Parthenon who will help the BHE develop a better measure to monitor this matter. He noted that THESIS is working collaboratively with stakeholders, including the New England Commission on Higher Education (NECHE), to validate fully this metric and we will continue to work throughout the fall and come back to the BHE with recommendations in January. He remarked that the current federal regime is not sufficient to solve this problem, adding that it cannot be solved unilaterally; it is urgent. Chairman Gabrieli stated that he wants the entire BHE to be engaged and encouraged them to ask questions.

Third, he commented on the September BHE retreat. The theme of the retreat was that there is a sense of urgency about changing conditions of higher education and we should encourage campuses to move quickly. The BHE should tighten its focus. The Executive Committee has drafted language on a high-level goal statement which is intended to address our broader vision and goals for the higher education field while prioritizing equity, including the reduction of gaps among traditionally underserved populations. Massachusetts will be the first state in the country to adopt this focus. He continued that the BHE needs to engage the campuses to think about this, as it will be different for each campus and their strategic plan. He stated that the Executive Committee will refine a proposal, including a timetable, and will report back to the full Board.

Chair Gabrieli concluded his remarks by welcoming everyone back to a new academic year.

## **B. COMMISSIONER'S REMARKS**

Commissioner Santiago welcomed everyone in attendance and thanked the Board. He thanked BHCC for hosting, and acknowledged the Presidents in attendance: James Birge of MCLA, Pam Eddinger of BHCC, Barry Maloney from Worcester State University, Ramon Torrecilha from Westfield State University, Laura Douglas from Bristol Community College, John Cox from Cape Cod Community College, Yves Salomon-Fernandez from Greenfield Community College, David Podell from MassBay Community College, James Mabry from Middlesex Community College, James Vander Hooven from Mount Wachusett Community College, Luis Pedraja from Springfield Technical Community College, Valerie Roberson from Roxbury Community College (RCC), Francis McDonald from Massachusetts Maritime Academy, John Keenan from Salem State University, and

Christina Royal from Holyoke Community College. He additionally acknowledged Gretchen Manning and Vincent Pedone from the segmental Executive Offices.

The Commissioner provided an overview of some of the actions that he took over the summer, in consultation with the BHE Chair, pursuant to his summer delegation of authority. First, he approved an Associate in Science degree in Health Science at Springfield Tech Community College, which was originally scheduled to be presented to the BHE in June 2018. This degree program represented a collaboration between STCC and Holyoke Community College in the health science space, with each institution bringing its strengths together to serve students in that region. DHE staff intend to monitor this partnership closely and share lessons learned.

A second action was the approval of amendments to the State Universities' Segmental Affirmative Action Plan. Dating back to at least 1986, the Board of Higher Education (BHE) has historically approved segmental affirmative action plans for public higher education institutions. These segmental affirmative action plans include policy statements and procedures which addresses an institution's Title IX legal responsibilities. The State Universities undertook a comprehensive review of their Segmental Affirmative Action plan, and suggested revisions that are intended to either: 1) comply with current USDOE guidance; or 2) correct or clarify procedural concerns and issues that have arisen in practice in implementing their earlier 2014 plan. Staff reviewed all documentation and legal citations submitted by the State Universities in support of the requested amendments and recommended approval of the proposed amendments. The Commissioner remarked that he concurred and subsequently approved the administrative changes.

The Commissioner continued by stating that the third and final action he took was to approve the Framingham State University Strategic Plan. The plan was submitted as part of Touch Point III and had been approved earlier by Framingham State University's Board of Trustees. The plan relied on extensive campus input, clearly laid out the strategic direction of the institution, and provided a useful cross-walk between goals, strategies, and appropriate operational measures to determine whether the institution was moving in the right direction to achieve its goals. Board Member and SPC Chair Reimers and Chair Gabrieli were both quite helpful in raising questions that Framingham State answered throughout the review process.

The Commissioner also highlighted a series of events that occurred since the last BHE meeting in June. He reported that the U.S. Department of Education recently announced winners of the national competition for the Gaining Early Awareness and Readiness for Undergraduate Programs (GEAR UP) state and partnership grants. Grantees will share a portion of a \$350 million budget approved under the Labor-HHS-Education appropriation bill for 2018. A total of 61 state and partnership grants were awarded, with Massachusetts being one of only six states to receive a GEAR UP State grant under this competition. Massachusetts will receive a \$4.2m annual award over the next seven years, a nearly \$30 million investment. He then acknowledged the GEAR UP staff in attendance including Senior Deputy Commissioner Clantha McCurdy and GEAR Up Director Robert Dais.

The Commissioner remarked that It has been a real pleasure to join the Governor, Lt. Governor, Secretary, Board Chair, and campus presidents to visit some of the early college programs across

the Commonwealth. He noted considerable enthusiasm for the early college efforts and the combination of expertise at the high school, community college, and four-year institutional levels has engendered real collaboration and models of student success. This effort is still being fine-tuned but participating students have told us they are excited for the opportunity they have received and eager to succeed in their college experience.

Finally, the Commissioner referenced Chair Gabrieli's comments on the THESIS working group that has been charged with advising the BHE on approaches to closures, mergers, and consolidations for independent institutions experiencing financial distress. The Board Chair has provided updates and the work continues; he appreciates Chair Gabrieli's leadership in this important effort, and stated that he looks forward to discussing with the BHE the THESIS group recommendations in the coming months. Commissioner Santiago referenced Chair Gabrieli's earlier comments on the post-retreat discussions regarding an emerging strategic framework that will enable the BHE to remain highly focused on key goals, while championing an equity lens upon which to assess our strategies and progress. He remarked this will be an exciting conversation that will certainly occupy much of our time over the academic year.

### **C. SECRETARY OF EDUCATION'S REMARKS**

Secretary Peyser stated that he is pleased to announce that it is STEM week in the Commonwealth, an important initiative across the Commonwealth. He discussed the importance of STEM to the economy, adding that the Commonwealth's economy hinges upon STEM fields a third more than the rest of the country. This matters to our students, our institutions, our economy, and our employers. He stated that the celebration of STEM week continues and encouraged those in attendance to participate and support students in the STEM fields.

Before turning to the next agenda item, Chair Gabrieli asked BHE members if they had any comments or reflections on the earlier discussion regarding BHE goals.

Board member J.D. LaRock remarked that he commends the work that has been done. The work on equity goals is impressive and he appreciates the invitation to the segmental representatives. He continued that at North Shore Community College (NSCC), they have concentrated on achievement gaps, and he is pleased they are focused on this area. Making it an explicit invitation gives the community colleges the opportunity for engagement.

### **D. REPORTS FROM PRESIDENTS**

#### **Community College Presidents' Report – RCC President Valerie Roberson**

##### List of Documents Submitted by President Roberson

*None*

President Roberson thanked Chair Gabrieli, Secretary Peyser, Commissioner Santiago and the BHE. She stated that as we begin another academic year together, she looks forward to a productive year in serving as chair of the Community College Council of Presidents. She stated that she plans to utilize her time this year to highlight examples of how the community college segment is contributing to the state's system-level strategic framework, more commonly known as the "Big Three" priorities. Whenever possible, she will highlight strategies where community colleges partner with state universities, businesses, high schools, and community agencies to

ensure that we are efficient in our use of state resources, that we are making connections that support and inspire students to complete their studies, and that we enable students to transition to baccalaureate studies or employment.

President Roberson continued by stating that she would briefly address two topics: Financial Aid and STEM Week. First, she thanked the Administration and the Legislature for the new FY19 financial aid dollars that are going directly to help provide community college students access to workforce credentials, to degrees and certificates, and to their first steps to their transfer pathways with our public higher education partners. President Roberson stated that financial aid is directly related to the State's first system-level priority of making college more affordable and accessible. It is an essential component of making college possible for many families and their students, and is also critical to many students' abilities to persist and complete their degrees. President Roberson additionally thanked and acknowledged Commissioner Santiago and his team at the DHE for their efforts in working with our segment to make the new dollars available this semester, noting that just a quick sampling of our colleges indicates that we were able to help more than 2,000 students with these new funds, in this first semester of implementation. She added that it was especially helpful that these funds were available to part-time students.

Next, referencing Secretary Peyser's earlier comments, President Roberson offered comments on the Governor's new STEM Week initiative, adding that STEM Week is intended to bring attention to the many STEM careers available, and to encourage students at all educational levels to consider and prepare for the new STEM economy. President Roberson stated that during the kick-off event at Dearborn STEM Academy in Roxbury, Governor Baker predicted that all jobs in the future will include some elements of technology and science. This means that we will need to ensure that students who graduate from our institutions are prepared for this high tech economy. She remarked that from her experience, technology is already changing job requirements. One STEM program in final development at Roxbury Community College (RCC) is Smart Building Technology, an emerging field that enables businesses to meet new standards for high energy efficient buildings and to realize cost savings by utilizing new technologies like solar and geothermal systems. Our Smart Building Technology Program started when business leaders sought RCC to train the individuals needed for this work. RCC was able to develop the curriculum needed with the assistance of faculty from Mass Maritime Academy because this institution already had a similar 4-year program. She remarked that this is the type of partnership she will be highlighting; those where both segments of higher education benefit and gain efficiencies by working together. She thanked Admiral McDonald and his staff, noting that they were able to re-vamp engineering courses to respond to the needs of business leaders and to also ensure that students who begin at RCC have a path to transfer to Mass Maritime.

President Roberson continued by stating that STEM Week events are designed to help students to understand and experience careers like smart building technology, noting that there is still time to attend events: over 500 were planned across the state, with over 40 at community colleges. She encouraged the BHE to take a moment to review these events that are highlighted on the website of the Massachusetts Community Colleges. President Roberson concluded her remarks and stated that she looks forward to working with the BHE in the up-coming year.

## **State University Presidents' Report – Bridgewater State University President Fran McDonald**

### List of Documents Submitted by President McDonald

*None*

President McDonald thanked Secretary Peyser, Chair Gabrieli, Commissioner Santiago and the BHE for the opportunity to provide his first state university system update as Chair of the Council of Presidents this year. He then acknowledged and thanked Bridgewater State University President Fred Clark for his work last year as COP Chair that strengthened the working relationship between the DHE, BHE, and the state universities, as well as for his collaborative efforts with the community colleges.

President McDonald then highlighted recent national rankings received by the state universities, beginning with MMA's recognition in *Time's* Money Magazine as the third best return on investment in Massachusetts and ranking in the top 25 colleges and university in return on investment in the country. He stated that several factors have led to the Academy's high ranking by Money Magazine, including annual salaries of graduates, high graduation rates, and MMA's efforts to keep tuition and fees affordable through efficiency efforts and generous donors to the Academy's foundation.

He also highlighted a recent study by the University of Southern California's Race and Equity Center which found that five of our state universities led the nation in terms of black student success and access at four year public universities and colleges. Of the 506 public institutions ranked in the study, the Massachusetts College of Liberal Arts (MCLA) was ranked first in the nation in serving black students. Other state universities who ranked in the top 50 included Fitchburg, Salem, Framingham, and Bridgewater State Universities. As a system, the state universities ranked among the highest in the nation. He added that while there is much work remaining to be done to close achievement gaps, to create more inclusive environments on our campuses, and to improve graduation rates for underrepresented populations, the state universities are very proud of the work underway and for the recognition they received from this report.

President McDonald continued by highlighting examples of the nine state universities' continuing efforts to fulfilling their mission of providing a high quality and affordable post-secondary education to all students in the Commonwealth, particularly those from underserved communities. Examples cited included: a Westfield State University initiative developed in collaboration with Holyoke Community College and Springfield public schools, which seeks to develop STEM field teachers in underrepresented population; the "Artward Bound" program at MassArt, which is a free, four-year college access program that encourages and prepares Boston-area high school students who are interested in art and design, but lack resources to foster their interest; and a summer bridge program at Worcester State University which provides educational assistance to underrepresented prospective students who demonstrate the desire to succeed in college.

President McDonald also referenced that the strong collaborative work between the state universities and community colleges, stating that the 24 presidents continue to be committed to

furthering a public advocacy effort aimed at promoting the undeniable link between public higher education and the economic health of the Commonwealth. During this past January's BHE meeting, Presidents Clark and Kennedy presented the outline of that advocacy work which focuses on the economic benefits of investing in our public colleges and universities, as well as the existing collaborative efforts between the two segments on numerous system-wide initiatives, including cost saving measures and efficiencies, on-line education, the Commonwealth Commitment, transfer, developmental education, department led initiatives, and legislative advocacy.

President McDonald commented on the FY20 state budget request and the priorities of the state universities. He remarked that the state universities were appreciative of the DHE and the BHE's advocacy through the FY19 budget process. That budget recognized collective bargaining costs within campus line items, modest increases to the state university funding formula line item and continued funding for the state university internship incentive program. For the first time in several fiscal years, the signed budget included a significant increase to the state's financial aid line item with the bulk of those funds directed towards community college students. He added that this major investment in financial aid was long overdue, and for FY20, the state universities asked the BHE to consider recommending another increase to the state's financial aid line item directed specifically for state university students. President McDonald stated that the state's largest financial aid program, MASSGrant, once covered about 85% of a public college student's cost of attending a public higher education institution and now it covers only about 8%. Last academic year, DHE staff presented a report on financial aid in Massachusetts. That report showed that the unmet needs of public higher education students continues to grow. Increases in state financial aid dollars, directed towards public higher education students, can significantly impact closing the unmet financial needs of state university students.

President McDonald concluded his remarks by thanking the BHE and inviting them to visit any or all of the state university campuses to show the great work that is being done.

#### **E. REPORT FROM STUDENT ADVISORY COUNCIL (SAC)**

Student member Patel remarked that the SAC held their retreat earlier this month at Framingham State University. He then introduced the non-voting, segmental student advisors: Stephanie Teixeira from Quinsigamond Community College, and Nick Papa from Salem State University. From the retreat, they were able to set goals for the year and at their next meeting in December at Springfield Technical Community College they will further elaborate on these goals. He concluded his remarks by stating that he is excited for this year and is looking forward to working with everyone.

#### **VI. MOTIONS**

##### List of Documents Used

*AAC 19-02 as moved by the Academic Affairs Committee on October 16, 2018*

*University of Massachusetts Amherst response to questions posed by Academic Affairs Committee on October 16, 2018*

*AAC 19-03*

*SPC 19-02 and 19-03*

## **A. Academic Affairs**

Chair Gabrieli turned the meeting over to Acting Academic Affairs Committee (AAC) Board member Fernando Reimers to provide an update on the recent AAC meeting. Board member Reimers stated that in addition to receiving three presentations, the committee reviewed two proposals, one from a new institution and one from the University of Massachusetts (UMass) Amherst. Board member Reimers stated that the AAC did not approve a proposal from UMass Amherst to offer the Master of Finance in Alternative Investments, citing concerns with equity and affordability and questions about whether the proposal adequately demonstrated the program's strategic connection to its mission. However, the AAC determined that due to the proposal's other merits, it should be moved forward to the full Board for consideration without a recommendation, pending UMass Amherst submitting supplementary information. Yesterday, Commissioner Santiago provided the BHE with the University's response for further information.

Board member Reimers began the discussion by remarking that he realizes the very difficult position that our public universities are in due to the decline of support for public higher education, which has not recovered from pre-recession levels. This is a difficult position and our campuses have to generate revenue in ways that may not be central to their mission. However, he asked, 1) if the revenue were not a factor, would UMass still be bringing this program forward for approval, and 2) what is the return on investment (ROI) for this program for the ROI on this program for Massachusetts?

Deputy Commissioner Marshall noted that there were representatives from UMass Amherst present to address these concerns and asked them to come forward: Linda Enghagen, Associate Dean of Graduate and Professional Programs, Isenberg School of Management, and Associate Provost Farshid Hajir. Before turning to the UMass representatives, Deputy Commissioner Marshall provided background and context on the proposal and the response from UMass, for the benefit of BHE members who were not at the AAC meeting. She added that the AAC requested updated enrollment projection data, since the initial draft of the proposal dated back to 2016 and that proposal relied heavily on international students from China. She stated that the proposal has been updated to include a broader population of Massachusetts residents. Additionally, the supplementary materials identify a more direct connection to the mission. The statements on access begins to address the questions by Board member Reimers. This program is \$80,000 more affordable than ones offered by competitors, and the institution will also offer scholarships to underrepresented groups and give a significant discount to in-state students.

Provost Hajir responded to Dr. Reimers' questions. He responded affirmatively to the first question, stating that this program gives students an opportunity to earn a credential in a short period of time that leaves them uniquely positioned in an emerging segment of the workforce. Further, from the lens of Massachusetts STEM week, the starting salary for someone in this field could be triple the cost of the program. Associate Dean Enghagen added that UMass evaluated some numbers in response to AAC members' questions last week. They looked at the profile of the UMass on-campus master's level population across disciplines and across campus. There are roughly 24% international students and 76% domestic students this fall. She offered a

comparison to a similar program offered at the Isenberg School, the one-year MS in Business and Analytics program: 75% of students in that program are UMass undergrads, and two-thirds are Massachusetts residents who primarily remain in the Commonwealth. She remarked that graduates of that program yielded an average starting salary of over \$59,000, and that UMass is expecting similar results with this program. The entering students will have a higher level of demonstrated quantitative skills, but otherwise this program is similar to the others. Students will have a variety of backgrounds and it will allow students, regardless of their undergraduate program, to move towards a more focused master's degree.

Board member O'Brien said he is very supportive of the motion and this program. He remarked that it is a dynamic program and we should be looking at the business model of all of our programs. Secretary Peyser added that Massachusetts is a center for hedge funds, private equity, real estate investments and other kinds of investments that are captured by this program and this program is a good compliment to the other programs offered in the Isenberg School. He continued that it creates a bigger national and global footprint, not just for UMass but for the Commonwealth as a whole. Unfortunately, it was positioned as an international program initially but he does not think that will necessarily reflect the role it will actually play in the state. He cited the example of a Computer Science program at UMass Amherst that has significant enrollment primarily from China and that enrollment adds to the strength of the program, to UMass and to the Commonwealth while at the same time creating opportunities for our own students. He added that he is very supportive of the program and is hopeful that there will be a strong Massachusetts contingent.

Board member Cortez asked a clarifying question about financial aid and the financial projections. Associate Dean Enghagen responded that they have not yet been able to project in-state tuition with "reprojection" but they are not looking to grow this program by huge numbers. Board member Paul Mattera expressed concern with the AAC's decision to move the motion forward without a recommendation, stating that Board relies upon the committee process to work out issues such as this before asking for a Board vote. He indicated that he felt that he and other Board members were at a disadvantage with how the process evolved.

Chair Gabrieli remarked that the BHE has been working to change academic program approvals to focus more on these strategic questions and non-academic, to which UMass has objected. He continued that we do not have an effective strategy to address this systemically. He was impressed by the statistic provided about opportunity within the state. He remarked that he would like to ask AAC members to work with staff to see how the Board might learn more about programs after they have gone through the approval process. Board member Mattera remarked that this could be part of the program review. Board member Reimers remarked that the proposed revised program approval process is designed to ensure individual programs are aligned with and promote statewide goals, such as equity. He stated that he does not know where we go from here because this is the third time that UMass has surprised the Board with decisions that we have found out about too late.

Chair Gabrieli remarked that these are important questions and he hopes that we have a productive dialogue. He added that the supplementary memorandum provided by UMass was helpful. He stated that there was a broader issue around how does UMass and its programs fit into the broader system of public higher education in Massachusetts.

Board member Toner asked what kind of reporting, if any, does the BHE require to verify if strategic goals are being met. Commissioner Santiago responded that the BHE does have the authority to look back at a program and sometimes we do pay special attention to programs.

Student segmental advisor Teixeira asked if online access to the program was in the plans, as it could improve access. Dean Enghagen responded that UMass runs new programs entirely on campus for at least two years before moving them online. Eventually, they will look to online options, but she acknowledged they have not been as successful with hybrid models.

Board member La Rock stated that he would support this, but expressed concerns noting that public institutions exist to primarily serve the students of Massachusetts, and not China. He added that UMass Amherst is a land grant that has explicit language on mission and purpose, and wondered if we were at risk of getting away from the legally intended purposes of our institutions and beyond questions of strategy. He continued, stating that the BHE often talks about skill and workforce gaps, but that we also needed to have a conversation that addresses the intent of our institutions.

There being no further discussion, Chair Reimers called for a motion on AAC 19-02. On a motion duly made and seconded, AAC 19-02 was approved with seven votes in favor, two in opposition (Fernando Reimers and Kush Patel), and one abstention (Paul Mattera). The motion carried.

**AAC 19-02      APPLICATION OF THE UNIVERSITY OF MASSACHUSETTS AMHERST TO  
AWARD THE MASTER OF FINANCE IN ALTERNATIVE INVESTMENTS**

**MOVED:**            The Board of Higher Education hereby approves the application of the University of Massachusetts Amherst to award the Master of Finance in Alternative Investments.

Upon graduating the first class for this program, the University shall submit to the Board a status report addressing its success in reaching program goals as state in the application and in the areas of enrollment, curriculum, faculty resources, and program effectiveness.

**Authority:**        Massachusetts General Laws Chapter 15A, Section 9(b)

**Contact:**        Winifred M. Hagan, Ed.D.  
Associate Commissioner for Academic Affairs and Student Success

Board Member Reimers turned to the next item considered during the AAC meeting—a proposal by a California-based institution, Thomas Aquinas College, to operate a branch campus in Northfield, Massachusetts with the authority to award the Bachelor of Arts in Liberal Arts (AAC 19-03). He invited representatives from Thomas Aquinas College to the table. The BHE engaged in a brief discussion. Board member La Rock asked about the college’s annual gift numbers in the context of what the institution is raising as a whole intuition today. The President of Thomas Aquinas College, Michael McClean, responded that the college has been in operation for 50 years in Southern California, and they were able to successfully fundraise at that location, as well as fundraise for financial aid to meet the operating budget of the college. He continued that the Northfield campus was gifted to the college and they additionally received a matching \$5 million

grant from the National Christian Foundation. He continued that they have already raised \$4 million due to the generosity of their board, and have obtained a \$5 million line of credit.

There being no further discussion, Chair Reimers called for a motion on AAC 19-03. On a motion duly made and seconded, AAC 19-03 was conditionally approved with all members present voting in favor.

**AAC 19-03      APPLICATION OF THOMAS AQUINAS COLLEGE TO AWARD THE BACHELOR OF ARTS IN LIBERAL ARTS**

**MOVED:**      The Board of Higher Education hereby conditionally approves the Foreign Corporation Certificate of Registration, as amended, of Thomas Aquinas College for the purpose of operating a branch campus in Northfield, Massachusetts with the authority to award the Bachelor of Arts in Liberal Arts.

Provided further that the BHE will undertake to review, during the twelve-year period set forth in 610 CMR 2.05(5), the continued progress of the institution toward meeting and maintaining compliance with the BHE's regulations, the visiting committee's recommendations, the goals and representations set forth in connection with the institution's petition to the BHE, and its compliance with the following conditions:

1. For the first five years of operation, the President shall submit to the Commissioner of Higher Education the credentials of faculty (i.e. tutors) hired to teach in the degree program.
2. For the first five years of operation, the institution shall submit to the BHE annual status reports providing narrative and statistical information on the institution's compliance with the BHE standards and with the goals and representations set forth in connection with the institutions' petition, including updates on:
  - Hiring and enrollment;
  - Finances, including fundraising efforts and philanthropic donations pledged and received;
  - Capital adaptation and renewal plans, including the financing of the same and deferred maintenance;
  - Plans for an overarching strategic planning process;
  - Governance of the new branch campus; and
  - Any other information as requested by Department staff
3. The institution shall post on its website a notice regarding the conditional nature of the BHE's approval of the institution's degree granting authority, the exact language of which is to be determined by Department staff after consultation with the institution.

**Authority:** Massachusetts General Laws Chapter 69, Section 30 et seq.

**Contact:** Patricia A. Marshall, Ph.D., Deputy Commissioner for Academic Affairs and Student Success

### **Presentation: Highlights from Early College at Bunker Hill Community College**

In the interest of time, Chair Gabrieli stated that he wanted to take up the Early College agenda item next, as several Early College students were in attendance and have been patiently waiting to address the Board and they need to get back to class. Chair Gabrieli invited the students to the table. President Eddinger and BHCC Dean Nuri Chandler Smith introduced the topic and the students. President Eddinger provided an overview of the dual enrollment and early college programs at BHCC, which is very robust and impactful, and split half and half between dual enrollment and Early College. She remarked that BHCC has funding through a foundation for early college programming. Their programming includes curricular alignment and a mixed enrollment model that eliminates the need for developmental education.

Dean Nuri Chandler Smith introduced four Early College students, Danny Munoz and Brian Portillo from Charlestown High School and Maria Figueroa and Johana Alvarado Ortiz from Chelsea High School. Dean Chandler-Smith said the students would be speaking about their experience as participants in BHCC's Early College programs. She then facilitated a question and answer session that provided some insight into the students' early college experience. Topics covered included, why the students were interested and what their experiences have been like. The students spoke quite positively about their experience in the program and reported they were interested in earning college credits, to expand opportunity and to get a sense of what college is like. They reported that the experience has given them an opportunity to figure out future educational goals and to be with other similarly motivated students. They also have gained internship experience, exposure to STEM and business fields, and it has boosted their self-confidence.

The BHE engaged in a discussion at the conclusion of the students' question period. Board member Reimers told the students that they are awesome and that Massachusetts is better because of students like them. He remarked that he was the first person in his family to go to college and at their age, he would not have the maturity to speak before the BHE. Student segmental advisor Teixeira remarked that she is so impressed with the students, and that she did not have this opportunity, but if she did, it would not have taken her several years to go back to college. Student member Patel encouraged the students to take advantage of the opportunities they have.

Chair Gabrieli remarked that students as young as 9<sup>th</sup> graders are being exposed to business and there is opportunity to be exposed to all these different fields. He remarked that he is super appreciative of this presentation and the collaboration of high schools and college is wonderful. He thanked the students and BHCC for their presentation.

### **B. Strategic Planning**

Chair Gabrieli turned the meeting over to Strategic Planning Committee (SPC) Chair Fernando Reimers. Chair Reimers remarked that last week, there was an SPC meeting where the committee

approved two campus strategic plans and engaged in a Touch Point II conversation with Westfield State University. He then asked for a motion for Approval of SPC 19-02: Approval of Massachusetts Bay Community College's Strategic Plan. On a motion duly made and seconded, SPC 19-02 was unanimously approved by all BHE members present, without discussion.

**SPC 19-02            APPROVAL OF MASSACHUSETTS BAY COMMUNITY COLLEGE STRATEGIC PLAN**

**MOVED:**            The BHE hereby approves the Massachusetts Bay Community College Strategic Plan, 2017-2022: A Catalyst for Transformation, and authorizes the Commissioner to forward the same to the Secretary of Education for final approval pursuant to Massachusetts General Laws Chapter 15A, Sections 9(l) and 22(l).

**Authority**            Massachusetts General Laws Chapter 15A, Sections 7, 9(f), 9(l), and 22(l); BHE By-Laws, Article 1, Section 3(d) and Article III.

**Contact**            Winifred M. Hagan, Ed.D.  
Associate Commissioner for Academic Affairs and Student Success

Chair Reimers then asked for a motion for approval of SPC 19-03: Approval of Quinsigamond Community College's Strategic Plan. On a motion duly made and seconded, SPC 19-03 was unanimously approved by all BHE members present, without discussion.

**SPC 19-02            APPROVAL OF QUINSIGAMOND COMMUNITY COLLEGE STRATEGIC PLAN**

**MOVED:**            The BHE hereby approves the Quinsigamond Community College 2018-2022 Strategic Plan, and authorizes the Commissioner to forward the same to the Secretary of Education for final approval pursuant to Massachusetts General Laws Chapter 15A, Sections 9(l) and 22(l).

**Authority**            Massachusetts General Laws Chapter 15A, Sections 7, 9(f), 9(l), and 22(l); BHE By-Laws, Article 1, Section 3(d) and Article III.

**Contact**            Winifred M. Hagan, Ed.D.  
Associate Commissioner for Academic Affairs and Student Success

**C. Fiscal Affairs and Administrative Policy**

Chair Gabrieli turned the meeting over to Fiscal Affairs and Administrative Policy (FAAP) committee Chair Tom Hopcroft. Chair Hopcroft remarked that the FAAP committee received a presentation from Ed Adelman from MSCBA and is bringing forward seven building projects for the Board's approval. The committee also had the opportunity to identify some goals for the upcoming fiscal year, as well as have a robust discussion on the current fiscal year's budget.

Chair Hopcroft then called for a motion to approve FAAP 19-09: Approval of FAAP 19-02 through 19-08 on a Consent Agenda. On a motion duly made a seconded, FAAP 19-09 was unanimously approved by all BHE members present.

**FAAP 19-09      CONSENT AGENDA FAAP 19-02 through 19-08**

**MOVED:**      The Board of Higher Education approves the following motions on a consent agenda:

FAAP 19-02      Approval of Massachusetts State College Building Authority Fitchburg State University Dining Services Improvements

FAAP 19-03      Approval of Massachusetts State College Building Authority Fitchburg State University Recreation Center Roof Replacement

FAAP 19-04      Approval of Massachusetts State College Building Authority Framingham State University Athletic Facility Improvements

FAAP 19-05      Approval of Massachusetts State College Building Authority Massachusetts College of Liberal Arts Athletic Facility Improvements

FAAP 19-06      Approval of Massachusetts State College Building Authority Massachusetts Maritime Academy Athletic Field Improvements

FAAP 19-07      Approval of Massachusetts State College Building Authority Residence Hall Renewal and Adaption System-Wide

FAAP 19-08      Approval of Massachusetts State College Building Authority Revenue Bond Refunding

**Authority:**      M.G.L. Chapter 15A, Section 6

**Contact:**      Thomas Simard, Deputy Commissioner for Administration and Finance

**D. Board of Higher Education**

In the absence of Chair Gabrieli who had briefly stepped out of the room, Board member Reimers asked for a motion of BHE 19-01: Commissioner's FY2018 Performance Evaluation. There being no discussion, on a motion duly made and seconded, BHE 19-01 was approved by all BHE members present. Chair Gabrieli returned to the room and apologized for inadvertently missing the vote, but thanked Board members for moving steadily ahead with the agenda items.

**BHE 19-01            COMMISSIONER’S FY2018 PERFORMANCE EVALUATION**

**MOVED:**

The Board of Higher Education hereby approves the attached Commissioner’s FY2018 Performance Evaluation, as prepared by members of the Executive Committee.

**Authority**            Massachusetts General Laws Chapter 15A, Section 6

**Contact:**            Constantia T. Papanikolaou, General Counsel

**VII. PRESENTATIONS**

List of documents used

*FY19 Early Enrollment Report Tableau Presentation*

*Performance Measurement Update Tableau Presentation*

*Performance Measurement Glossary of Terms*

**Fall FY19 Early Enrollment Report**

Chair Gabrieli turned the meeting over to Commissioner Santiago. Commissioner Santiago set the context and provided background for the Early Enrollment report. He noted that today, for the first time, DHE Staff will present campus-level data, instead of just segmental data. He added that usually, this discussion is focused on demography but it is also important to discuss the economy. He stated that he invited three campus Presidents to talk about the challenges they face that are unique to their campuses: John Cox from Cape Cod Community College (CCCC), Yves Salomon-Fernandez from Greenfield Community College (GCC) and John Keenan from Salem State University (SSU). He also introduced Jonathan Keller, Senior Associate Commissioner for Research and Planning and turned the meeting over to him to facilitate the discussion.

Senior Associate Commissioner Keller began his presentation with the caveat that it is early in the academic year and 2018 enrollment data that has not yet been frozen, but he does not anticipate any significant changes. He remarked the presentation will be different than those from prior years because it considers campus level data and regional differences. He added that enrollment is definitely not a uniform story and going down to the campus level is very instructive. Next, he reviewed a slide that illustrated student enrollment for the past 10 years, emphasizing the decline since 2013. He remarked that there is a decline in traditional age student population, but the decline in high school population is not the whole story, because it is not as significant as people might think. He also presented data that showed regional differences in projected 15-24 year old populations for 2020-2035, demonstrating that in some areas, such as Suffolk county, there will be an increase in population but many other counties will experience a decrease.

Senior Associate Commissioner Keller continued the presentation with a data that demonstrated significant segmental differences. Community Colleges have experienced the most substantial growth and subsequent decline. UMass and State University student populations have not declined despite the decrease in traditional populations. He continued by presenting data on the traditional aged student pipeline, and remarked that the state universities have the strong correlation between enrollment levels and changes in the size of graduation classes in

Massachusetts high schools while community colleges have the weakest correlation. He continued by presenting data on the drivers of change, noting that the economy and unemployment rate has a strong correlation with community college enrollment, which reflect the preferences and realities for many community college students.

Senior Associate Commissioner Keller finished his portion of the presentation by presenting enrollment trends by institution, for each segment. For the Community Colleges, he remarked that some schools are at their lowest enrollment since 1995 while others, such as BHCC are almost at their peak. For UMass, he noted that most institutions are at their peak with one exception. He noted that demographic changes do not tell the whole story since there is so much variation across the segments.

Commissioner Santiago stated that he invited Presidents to this presentation because this needs to be a nuanced discussion; one size fits all will not work. He then invited President Cox to make some remarks. President Cox provided highlights, with examples, of how CCCC has addressed population changes over the past few years with a three pronged approach: 1) Adapting to students' time constraints and enabling students to access education in a more flexible format; 2) immersive and accelerated education options, that students to complete their program of study and begin careers; and 3) addressing socioeconomic and mental health needs of their students.

Paul Toner stepped out of the meeting at 12:45 p.m.

GCC President Yves Salomon-Fernandez described GCC's structural inclusion model and noted that Western Massachusetts is also experiencing a population decline. She stated that they are examining the academic enterprise models for GCC as an institution, so they can meet enrollment peaks and enrollment declines. GCC is additionally collaborating with STCC and Holyoke on staffing and programming to better serve their students. President Salmon-Fernandez continued that the economy is changing; we are looking at what is projected to happen to see what academic programs will be needed to meet the needs of the economy. GCC is partnering with local employers to see how their needs are evolving, which will also position the region itself to be much more agile and adaptive.

Before beginning his presentation, SSU President John Keenan pointed out that he has provided BHE members with a longer version of the PowerPoint presentation with slides from his institution, but in the interest of time would only focus on one slide. He cited data on Salem State University's headcount and freshman rates on Pell eligibility, as well as freshman increases in students of color. SSU has also experienced increases in the number of degrees conferred; students are graduating on time, which has led to a reduction of students on campus. He remarked that a top priority is increases in financial aid, as well as strong partnerships. He added that we need to create better partnerships between the State Universities and Community Colleges, and then referenced the doctoral program in Physical Therapy, which is a way to be creative regarding enrollment.

Board member Paul Toner returned to the meeting at 12:56 p.m. Board member Michael O'Brien briefly excused himself from the meeting at 12:57 p.m.

The BHE engaged in a very brief discussion at the conclusion of the presentation. Board member Reimers asked about international student enrollment at community colleges. President Cox

responded that it was a non-issue at CCCC. Chair Gabriel thanked the Presidents for their presentation.

Board members Reimers excused himself from the meeting at 1:00 p.m.; Student Segmental Advisor Stephanie Teixeira also excused herself at 1:05 p.m.

### **Update on Performance Measurement System**

Commissioner Santiago introduced the final presentation on the Performance Measurement system, noting that performance measurement is required by statute. He reminded the Board that DHE staff was charged to move this process forward with campus collaboration, to determine what our strategies will be to evaluate success. He stated that this is a foundational discussion and that the Board will consider a motion to adopt certain metrics at its December 2018 meeting. He then turned the meeting over to Senior Associate Commissioner Keller. Board Member O'Brien returned to the meeting.

Senior Associate Commissioner Keller stated that in the interest of time he would provide a very brief overview. DHE staff have approached developing the metrics collaboratively by convening campus representatives several times and also engaging national leaders in the field. He provided an overview on the Glossary of Proposed Performance Measurement Metrics for Public Higher Education and noted that for any metric that has a student performance outcome, we are very quick to look at gaps including family income, Pell eligibility and race/ethnicity. He provided an overview of the metrics concerning access to public higher education, affordability of public higher education, student success and completion, workforce alignment and outcomes, and fiscal stewardship. He remarked that some of the highlights of his discussions with the campus representatives include the differences in mission and success at the Community Colleges and State Universities, and using a modified composite financial index for fiscal stewardship metrics.

He continued by discussing the next steps, which include a November 2018 meeting of the steering committee, and in December, the BHE will vote to take action with a March implementation. He remarked that the end product will be a Tableau dashboard, and the DHE will also prepare quarterly reports and provide expanded external access for the BHE and campuses to really dig into the data.

The BHE engaged in a brief discussion at the conclusion of this presentation. Board member O'Brien asked if this will require campus board approvals. Senior Associate Commissioner Keller responded that the DHE works in collaboration with the campuses but the law does not specify a campus level vote. Secretary Peyser also provided feedback, which included commentary on the need for special attention to the awarding of certificates, and noting the differences in cost of instruction based on program type.

### **VIII. OTHER BUSINESS**

There was no other business.

### **IX. ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, Chairman Gabrieli adjourned the meeting at 1:25 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,  
Carlos E. Santiago

Commissioner of the Department and  
Secretary to the Board